LESSON PLAN

Columbus Day or Indigenous Peoples Day?

Compelling Question: Should we change Columbus Day to Indigenous Peoples Day?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Level</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Common Core Standards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K-2</td>
<td>3-5 Minutes</td>
<td>Reading: R1, R4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Writing: W1, W4, W5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td>HS</td>
<td>Speaking &amp; Listening: SL1, SL4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LESSON OVERVIEW

Columbus Day is a federal holiday that commemorates Christopher Columbus’ landing in the Americas (the “New World”) on October 12, 1492. It became an official holiday in 1937. For many, the holiday honors Columbus’ achievements, celebrates Italian-American culture and heritage and pays tribute to patriotism. According to a 2017 poll, 58% of Americans still believe the U.S. should honor the Italian explorer. At the same time, throughout history, Columbus Day and Christopher Columbus have generated much controversy. In recent years, many alternatives to the holiday have emerged. The main sources of controversy involve Columbus and the other Europeans’ interactions with the indigenous people that led to hundreds of years of: (1) violence and slavery, (2) forced assimilation and conversion of Native American people to Christianity and (3) the introduction of a host of new diseases that would have dramatic long-term effects on Native American people.

In 1977, the idea of replacing Columbus Day with a day commemorating the indigenous people of North America was proposed by the International Conference on Discrimination against Indigenous Populations in the Americas, sponsored by the United Nations. Fourteen years later, in 1992, the city council in Berkeley, California declared October 12 as a “Day of Solidarity with Indigenous People” and symbolically renamed Columbus Day “Indigenous Peoples’ Day” beginning in 1992. Berkeley was the first city to do so. Since then, several states, cities and universities have followed suit.

This lesson provides an opportunity for students to learn more about Columbus Day, reflect on why some cities and states have renamed it Indigenous Peoples Day and consider their own points of view on the topic by engaging in a writing project to express their perspective.

LEARNING OBJECTIVES

- Students will understand why certain states and cities have changed the holiday of Columbus Day to Indigenous Peoples Day (or in a few cases, Native Americans Day).
- Students will reflect on primary source material (proclamations and resolutions) enacted by local governments to gain insight into their thinking about why they changed the holiday’s name.
- Students will consider their own points of view in writing as to whether they think they holiday’s name should be changed or not.

Web Related Connections

Lessons
Lewis and Clark: The Unheard Voices
Should Washington’s NFL Team Change Their Name?
Table Talk
Sports, Mascots and Bias

Key Words
(See ADL’s Education Glossary Terms.)
abolish activists ancestral benevolent delegation descendants embattled flourished glorification immemorial indigenous legacy patriotism philosophy proclamation relocated resolution symbolizes systemic
MATERIALS & PREPARATION

- “How Columbus Sailed Into U.S. History, Thanks To Italians” (NPR, October 14, 2013, www.npr.org/sections/codeswitch/2013/10/14/232120128/how-columbus-sailed-into-u-s-history-thanks-to-italians), one copy for each student
- Proclamations (divide six proclamations evenly between small groups, each student receives a copy of their group’s assigned proclamation)
- Proclamations Worksheet (one for each student)
- (Optional) Map of the United States to be displayed for whole class viewing (see Information Sharing activity)

PROCEDURES

Information Sharing

1. Ask students: What is Columbus Day? What do you know about the holiday? What have you learned in school about Columbus Day and Christopher Columbus? Do you know of another name for the holiday?

2. Explain to students that some states and cities have re-named the holiday of Columbus Day to Indigenous Peoples Day. Ask: Do you know any cities or states that have done that? Why do you think they renamed the holiday?

3. Share some or all of the following information:

4. Columbus Day is a federal holiday that commemorates Christopher Columbus’s landing in the Americas (the “New World”) on October 12, 1492 and is observed in the United States, and in parts of Canada and Puerto Rico. It became an official holiday in 1937.

   - According to History, the main source of controversy involves Columbus and the other Europeans’ interactions with the indigenous people that led to hundreds of years of: (1) the use of violence and slavery, (2) the forced assimilation and conversion of Native American people to Christianity and (3) the introduction of a host of new diseases that would have dramatic long-term effects on Native American people. Over the years, historians have uncovered extensive evidence of the damage wreaked by Columbus which has led to protests at Columbus Day celebrations and parades, an outcry about studying him in schools and calls for changing the name of the federal holiday.

   - Throughout history, Columbus Day and Christopher Columbus himself have generated a great deal of controversy. Native Americans and other groups have protested the celebration of an event that spurred oppression and genocide and which led to the demise of Native American people and culture. Millions died through infectious diseases brought by European settlers as well as warfare between Native Americans and colonists. In addition, Columbus forced native people into slavery and he allegedly imposed barbaric forms of punishment including torture.

   - In 1977, the idea of replacing Columbus Day with a day commemorating the indigenous of people of North America came out of the International Conference on Discrimination against Indigenous Populations in the Americas, sponsored by the United Nations. Fourteen years later, in 1992, the city council in Berkeley, California declared October 12 a “Day of Solidarity with Indigenous People” and symbolically renamed Columbus Day “Indigenous Peoples’ Day” beginning in 1992. Since then, several states, cities and towns have followed suit.

   - For many, the holiday honors Columbus’ achievements and also celebrates Italian-American culture and heritage. Columbus Day was proclaimed in 1937 by President Franklin D. Roosevelt who was lobbied heavily from the Knights of Columbus consisting largely of Italian-American people. The efforts to rename or eliminate the Columbus Day holiday in various cities and states has been met with strong resistance from the Italian American community, who feel that Christopher Columbus is an important figure in their
heritage, some even calling such activities “anti-Italian American.” According to a 2017 poll, 58% of Americans still believe the U.S. should honor the Italian explorer.

5. Tell students that you are going to read aloud the names of some of the cities and states who have renamed Columbus Day to Indigenous Peoples Day or another name. If you have a map available, point out the cities/states on the map.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITIES</th>
<th>Bozeman, MT</th>
<th>Seattle, WA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix, AZ</td>
<td>Lincoln, NE</td>
<td>Harpers Ferry, WV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td>Durham, NH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berkeley, CA</td>
<td>Lewiston, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boulder, CO</td>
<td>Ithaca, NY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denver, CO</td>
<td>Asheville, NC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durango, CO</td>
<td>Columbus, OH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Fulton, GA</td>
<td>Anadarko, OK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evanston, IL</td>
<td>Lancaster, PA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davenport, IA</td>
<td>Nashville, TN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawrence, KS</td>
<td>Bexar County, TX</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambridge, MA</td>
<td>Salt Lake City, UT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpena, MI</td>
<td>Charlottesville, VA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traverse City MI</td>
<td>Olympia, WA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reading Activity**

1. Distribute a copy of the article “How Columbus Sailed Into U.S. History, Thanks To Italians” and give students 15 minutes to read it silently. (You may also want to assign it for homework the night before you conduct the lesson.)

   - Engage students in a discussion by asking some or all of the following questions:
   - How did you learn that you didn’t know before?
   - How and why was Columbus Day originally established?
   - Why is Columbus Day particularly important to the Italian-American community?
   - In what ways was Columbus Day viewed as a tribute to patriotism?
   - What led to the 20th Century criticism of Columbus’ life and legacy?
   - What are the reasons for and against continuing to celebrate Columbus Day?

2. If time permits, have students also read the article “More cities celebrating ‘Indigenous Peoples Day’ amid effort to abolish Columbus Day” and discuss it briefly.

**Small Work Group: Proclamations**

1. Divide students into six small groups; each group will be assigned one proclamation among the six available: Alaska, Denver, Corvallis, Albuquerque, Seattle and Lewiston. Distribute a copy of the Proclamation Worksheet to each student and a copy of each assigned group’s proclamation (e.g., each student in the Alaska group should have the Alaska proclamation). Explain to students that a proclamation is a public or official announcement of an important matter.

2. Have one student in each group read their proclamation aloud as the other members of their group follow along. Students can jot down notes while listening. Then, instruct them to discuss and complete their Proclamation Worksheet.

3. Reconvene the large group. Have each small group make a brief presentation about their proclamation; one student from the group will read aloud the proclamation and another person from the group will share a summary of their conversation and responses to the questions.
4. Engage students in a brief discussion by asking the following questions:
   - What did you learn that you didn’t know before?
   - How were the proclamations similar and how were they different?
   - Why do you think these cities, towns and states made the decision to change the name of the holiday?

**Writing Activity**

1. Have students consider everything they have learned and put their thoughts and opinions into writing. Provide them with two options:
   - If they believe the name of the holiday should be changed, write their own proclamation (for their school, community or state). They can use some of the language and format from the proclamations they read but they should make sure to use most of their own words, thoughts and information about their school, community or state.
   - If they believe the name of the holiday should remain as Columbus Day, write a letter to an official (Principal, Mayor, or Governor) or a letter to the editor of a local paper with their thoughts, opinions and ideas as to why it should not be changed.

2. Provide time in class for students to begin working on their writing projects and assign the editing and completion of it for homework. When the writing assignments are due, have students share them with the class.

**Closing**

Do a brief go round with students sharing one thing they learned during the lesson.

**ADDITIONAL READING**

- [Columbus Controversy](#) (History)
- "[How Indigenous Peoples Day Came to Be](#)" (*TIME*, October 13, 2014)
- [Indigenous People’s Day](#) (Unitarian Universalist Association)
- "[Instead of Columbus Day, some celebrate Indigenous People’s Day](#)" (CNN, October 12, 2015)
- [United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People](#) (United Nations)
- "[What is Indigenous Peoples’ Day and why should it replace Columbus Day?](#)" (Upworthy, October 9, 2015)
- "[Why These Cities Are Dropping ‘Columbus Day’ For ‘Indigenous People’s Day’](#)" (Think Progress, October 15, 2015)
Common Core Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENT AREA/STANDARD</th>
<th>R1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R4: Interpret words and phrases as they are used in a text, including determining technical, connotative, and figurative meanings, and analyze how specific word choices shape meaning or tone.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>W1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>W4: Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose and audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>W5: Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking and Listening</td>
<td>SL1: Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SL4: Present information, findings, and supporting evidence such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, and style are appropriate to task, purpose and audience.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Proclamations: Alaska

WHEREAS, the Indigenous Peoples of the lands that would later become known as Alaska have occupied these lands since time immemorial, and Alaska is built upon the homelands and communities of the Indigenous Peoples of this region, without whom the building of the state would not be possible; and

WHEREAS, we value the many contributions made to our communities through Indigenous Peoples' knowledge, labor, technology, science, philosophy, arts, and the deep cultural contribution that has substantially shaped the character of Alaska; and

WHEREAS, the State recognizes the fact that Alaska is one “big village,” with over 16 percent of the State population having indigenous heritage – the highest percentage among all the United States; and

WHEREAS, the State opposes systematic racism toward Indigenous Peoples of Alaska or any Alaskans of any origin and promotes policies and practices that reflect the experiences of Indigenous Peoples, ensure greater access and opportunity, and honor our nation’s indigenous roots, history, and contributions; and

WHEREAS, Indigenous Peoples’ Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native Nations to the United Nations sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and

WHEREAS, in 2011 the Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians, representing 59 Tribes from Washington, Oregon, Idaho, Northern California, Western Montana, and some Alaskan Tribes, passed resolution #11-57 to “Support to Change Columbus Day (2nd Monday of October) to Indigenous Peoples’ Day;” and

WHEREAS, the State of Alaska joins a growing number of cities that have recognized the second Monday of October as Indigenous Peoples Day, creating an opportunity to promote appreciation, tolerance, understanding, friendship, and partnerships among Indigenous Peoples and all Alaskans.

NOW THEREFORE, I, Bill Walker, GOVERNOR OF THE STATE OF ALASKA, do hereby proclaim October 12, 2015 as:

Indigenous Peoples Day

in Alaska, and encourage all Alaskans to celebrate the thriving cultures and values of the Indigenous Peoples of our region and to continue efforts to promote the well-being and growth of Alaska’s Indigenous community.

DATED: October 9, 2015

Proclamations: Denver, CO

WHEREAS, Indigenous Peoples’ Day was first proposed in 1977, by a delegation of Native Nations to the United Nations-sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and

WHEREAS, Colorado encompasses the ancestral homelands of 48 tribes and currently the City and County of Denver and the surrounding communities are home to descendants of approximately 100 tribal nations; and

WHEREAS, the Council of the City and County of Denver recognizes that the Indigenous Peoples have lived and flourished on the lands known as the Americas since time immemorial, and that Denver and the surrounding communities are built upon on the ancestral homelands of numerous Indigenous tribes; and

WHEREAS, the seasonal encampments of the Arapaho and Cheyenne peoples along the banks of the Cherry Creek and South Platte River confluence gave bearing to future settlements that would later become the birthplace of the Mile High City; and

WHEREAS, the Council of the City and County of Denver recognizes and values the vast contributions made to our community through Indigenous Peoples’ knowledge, science, philosophy, arts and culture, and through these contributions the City of Denver has developed and thrived, and

WHEREAS, the City of Denver shall continue to promote racial equity and justice for all people and oppose discrimination towards Indigenous Peoples as it perpetuates poverty, income inequality, inequities in health and education.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT PROCLAIMED BY THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY AND COUNTY OF DENVER:

Section 1. That in the pursuit of the shared goals and responsibilities of promoting knowledge about Indigenous peoples, unifying communities, and combatting prejudice and eliminating discrimination against Indigenous Peoples the City and County of Denver, Colorado, does hereby proclaim October, 12 2015 as “Indigenous Peoples’ Day.”

Section 2. That the Council of the City and County of Denver celebrates and honors the cultural and foundational contributions of Indigenous People to the history of our City, State, and Country.

Section 3. That the Clerk of the City and County of Denver shall attest and affix the seal of the City and County of Denver to this proclamation and that a copy be transmitted to the Denver American Indian Commission, the Denver Agency for Human Rights and Community Partnerships, and the Governor of Colorado, John W. Hickenlooper.

PASSED BY THE COUNCIL October 12, 2015.

Proclamations: Corvallis, OR

PROCLAMATION INDIGENOUS PEOPLES' DAY

WHEREAS, Christopher Columbus, a man who is known to have "discovered" the Americas, came upon land that was already inhabited by Indigenous Peoples; and

WHEREAS, Columbus' voyage to the Americas opened the door to crimes, including but not limited to the introduction of transatlantic slavery and genocidal acts against Indigenous People; and

WHEREAS, The Indigenous People were promised security and protection though were forcibly relocated and their land seized to allow for European settlements; and

WHEREAS, The City of Corvallis and current day Benton County was historically inhabited by the Kalapuya people; and

WHEREAS, The City of Corvallis recognizes and acknowledges the significant contributions made in our community by Indigenous People and commits to ensure greater access and opportunity for continued contribution; and

WHEREAS, The City of Corvallis has the opportunity and means to cultivate a community that honors and respects the diverse history of our community; and

WHEREAS, The State of Oregon does not formally recognize Columbus Day; and

WHEREAS, The idea of Indigenous Peoples' Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native Nations to the United Nations; and

WHEREAS, This day should be recognized for the original inhabitants of the Americas - Indigenous People; and

NOW, THEREFORE, I, Biff Traber, Mayor of Corvallis, Oregon, do hereby proclaim Monday, October 12, 2015 as Indigenous Peoples' Day in the City and strongly encourage community members, schools, businesses, public and private organizations, and other community partners to join communities across America in recognizing and promoting the wellbeing and understanding of the contributions of our Indigenous communities.

Proclamations: Albuquerque, ME

WHEREAS, Albuquerque recognizes the occupation of New Mexico’s homelands for the building of our City and knows indigenous nations have lived upon this land since time immemorial and values the progress of our society accomplished through and by American Indian thought, culture, and technology; and

WHEREAS, the idea of Indigenous Peoples Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native nations to the United Nations-sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and

WHEREAS, in an effort to reveal a more accurate historical record of the “discovery” of the United States of America, representatives from 120 Indigenous nations at the First Continental Conference on 500 years of Indian Resistance, unanimously passed a resolution to transform Second Monday of October into an occasion to recognize the contributions of Indigenous people despite enormous efforts against native nations; and

WHEREAS, Albuquerque has a strong history throughout the years of supporting the American Indian Community and its citizens advancement in our current society and Albuquerque shall continue its efforts to promote the wellbeing and growth of Albuquerque’s American Indian Community and Indigenous Community; and

WHEREAS, Albuquerque encourages businesses, organizations and public entities to recognize Indigenous Peoples Day which shall be used to reflect upon the ongoing struggles of Indigenous people on this land, and to celebrate the thriving culture and value that our Indigenous nations add to our City.

BE IT PROCLAIMED THAT THE COUNCIL, THE GOVERNING BODY OF THE CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE, HEREBY RECOGNIZES THE SECOND MONDAY OF OCTOBER AS

INDIGENOUS PEOPLES DAY

Proclamations: Seattle, WA

A RESOLUTION relating to Indigenous Peoples’ Day; declaring the second Monday in October as Indigenous Peoples’ Day in the City of Seattle; encouraging other institutions to recognize the Day; and reaffirming the City’s commitment to promote the well-being and growth of Seattle’s American Indian and Indigenous community.

WHEREAS, the City of Seattle recognizes that the Indigenous Peoples of the lands that would later become known as the Americas have occupied these lands since time immemorial; and

WHEREAS, the City recognizes the fact that Seattle is built upon the homelands and villages of the Indigenous Peoples of this region, without whom the building of the City would not have been possible; and

WHEREAS, the City values the many contributions made to our community through Indigenous Peoples’ knowledge, labor, technology, science, philosophy, arts and the deep cultural contribution that has substantially shaped the character of the City of Seattle; and

WHEREAS, the City of Seattle has a responsibility to oppose the systematic racism towards Indigenous people in the United States, which perpetuates high rates of poverty and income inequality, exacerbating disproportionate health, education, and social crises; and

WHEREAS, the City promotes the closing of the equity gap for Indigenous Peoples through policies and practices that reflect the experiences of Indigenous Peoples, ensure greater access and opportunity, and honor our nation’s indigenous roots, history, and contributions; and

WHEREAS, Indigenous Peoples’ Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native Nations to the United Nations sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and

WHEREAS, in 2011 the Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians, representing 59 Tribes from Washington, Oregon, Idaho, Northern California, Western Montana and some Alaskan Tribes, passed resolution #11-57 to “Support to Change Columbus Day (2nd Monday of October) to Indigenous Peoples’ Day”; and

WHEREAS, the City of Seattle was declared to be a Human Rights City on December 10, 2012, committing itself to protect, respect and fulfill the full range of inherent human rights for all as set forth in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and numerous other international human rights treaties; and

WHEREAS, in 2014 the Seattle Human Rights Commission passed Resolution #14-03, “Recognizing the Second Monday of October as Indigenous Peoples’ Day”, which called upon the City to officially celebrate Indigenous Peoples’ Day in order to promote tolerance, understanding and friendship, and to combat prejudice and eliminate discrimination stemming from colonization.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SEATTLE, THE MAYOR CONCURRING, THAT:

Section 1. The City of Seattle strongly supports the proposition that Indigenous Peoples’ Day shall be an opportunity to celebrate the thriving cultures and values of the Indigenous Peoples of our region.

Section 2. The City of Seattle affirms that it is City policy to participate in the annual Indigenous Peoples’ Day celebrations and activities; that City departments work with the Seattle Office for Civil Rights (SOCR) and the Seattle Human Rights Commission to encourage participation on a citywide basis.

Section 3. The City of Seattle strongly encourages Seattle Public Schools to include the teaching of indigenous people’s history as recommended by Chapter 205, Session Laws of 2005.
Section 4. The City of Seattle encourages other businesses, organizations, and public institutions to recognize Indigenous Peoples’ Day.

Section 5. The City of Seattle firmly commits to continue its efforts to promote the well-being and growth of Seattle’s American Indian and Indigenous community.

Section 6. The Mayor and City Council of the City of Seattle jointly declare the second Monday in October as Indigenous Peoples’ Day in the City of Seattle.

Proclamations: Lewiston, NY

WHEREAS, the Town of Lewiston recognizes Indigenous people have lived upon this land since time immemorial and values the progress our society has accomplished through the contributions of the Indigenous peoples’ culture, and

WHEREAS, natives and non-natives have shared this community for hundreds of years and the Indigenous people have provided us friendship, guidance and protection, and

WHEREAS, the idea of Indigenous Peoples Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native nations to the United Nations – sponsored International Conference on Discrimination against Indigenous populations in the Americas, and

WHEREAS, other cities and communities, locally and around the Country, have declared their own Indigenous Peoples Day, including the Town of Newstead and Village of Akron in Erie County, and Seattle, Washington, Minneapolis, Minnesota, South Dakota also recognizes the second Monday in October as Native American Day, an official State holiday, and

WHEREAS, the Town Board of Lewiston, New York wishes to recognize Natives with a day to celebrate and honor Indigenous people to better reflect the experiences of Indigenous people and to hold in esteem their roots, history and contributions, and

WHEREAS, the Town of Lewiston wishes to preserve and promote the history and culture of all Indigenous people and believes the time has come to observe a yearly holiday in their name.

SO THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Town of Lewiston declares the second Monday in October as Indigenous Peoples Day in the Town of Lewiston from this day forward, and that it encourages continued recognition, appreciation and celebration of our goodwill and friendship with our local Indigenous Peoples.

Proclamation Worksheet

List group members below:

____________________________
____________________________
____________________________
____________________________

1. How did you feel as the proclamation/resolution was being read?

2. What is the purpose of the proclamation?

3. What relevant background information is shared?

4. What is the perspective of the proclamation?

5. What is being criticized in the proclamation?

6. What is being celebrated in the proclamation?

7. How do you think celebrations and school commemorations changed/may change as a result?